UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CIVIL LAW AND MOTION MINUTE ORDER

Date: 4/28/16	Time: 11:46-12:40	Judge: DONNA M. RYU	
Case No.: <u>13-md-02420-YGR</u>	Case Name: IN RE: LITHIUM ION BATTERIES		
	ANTITRUST LITIGATION		

For Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs:

Aaron M. Sheanin Carl Hammarskjold Jessica Moy

For Defendants Panasonic and Sanyo

Jeffrey J. Amato

For Defendant LG Chem Ltd. and LG Chem America, Inc.:

Mollie McGowan Lemberg

For Defendant Toshiba Corp.:

Andrew Black Heather Abrams

For Defendants Maxell Corp. of America and Hitachi Maxell, Ltd.:

Lindsey Vaala (via CourtCall)

Deputy Clerk: Ivy Lerma Garcia **FTR:** 11:46-12:40

PROCEEDINGS

1. Joint Discovery Letter Brief [Docket No. 1186]

For the reasons stated on the record, the court denies Defendants' motion to compel downstream discovery from DPPs for use in IPPs' case. Court also denies Defendants' motion to compel downstream discovery from DPPs for purposes of rebutting assertions of classwide impact. Defendants did not establish that the relevance and importance of the discovery would outweigh its burden, particularly in light of Defendants' admission that they chose to seek full-blown individualized downstream discovery, rather than tailor the requests to their stated theory of relevance.

Parties shall meet and confer regarding competitive intelligence and cost-plus contract discovery, and Circuit City's productions in the LCD and CRT cases. Joint letters

addressing any remaining disputes on these issues due by 5/6/16. Ritz immediately shall meet and confer with Defendants to remedy improper instruction not to answer deposition question that was reasonably related to DPP purchasing practice.

Ore	der to be prepared by:				
[]	Plaintiff	[]	Defendant	[]	Court
cc:	Chambers				